When is El Niño too hot to handle?: Evidence of a tolerance threshold for a marine top predator.



Chandra Goetsch, Patrick W. Robinson, Greg A. Breed, Sara M. Maxwell Melinda A. Fowler, Nicole M. Teutschel, Samantha E. Simmons



Daniel P. Costa, Daniel E. Crocker

Center for Ocean Health, University of California, Santa Cruz, USA Department of Biology, Sonoma State University, California, USA Marine Mammal Commission, Bethesda, MD USA



How does changing climate impact predators in pelagic systems?



Changes in oceanographic conditions . . .



... could lead to changes in prey distribution and availability

El Niño and Northern Elephant Seals



A Closer Look

Oceanic Niño Index (ONI)





The 1998 El Niño

Adult female elephant seals traveled longer but did worse.





Foraging Strategies of Female Northern Elephant Seals

An opportunity to see within population effects of climate variability



Study Questions:

1. Did the 2010 El Niño affect female Northern Elephant beyond the scope of normal yearly variation?





2. Did the 2010 El Niño differentially impact the foraging success of coastal vs. pelagic foragers?

Methods

Northern Elephant Seals: (Mirounga angustirostrum)

- Study site: Año Nuevo State Reserve, CA
- Long-term data set (n = 110)
- All 2010 animals had a previous control track from a non El Nino post-breeding migration
- Coastal (n = 10)and pelagic (n = 8) foragers





Data Collected

- Mass and body composition
- Blubber biopsies
- Tags deployed
 - MK10AF Fastloc GPS
 - SPOT 4 and SPOT 5 Argos transmitter
 - •MK9 TDR
- Wildlife Computers

Analysis

Metrics

Morphometrics

- Total Mass Gain (kg)
- Mass Gain Rate (kg/day)
- Percent Mass Gain
- Total Energy Gain (mJ)
- Energy Gain Rate (mJ/ day)

Tracking: State-Space Behavioral Switching Model

- Trip Duration
- Total Time in Foraging Mode
- Total Time in Transit Mode
- Percent Time in Foraging Mode
- Total Foraging Bouts
- Mean Foraging Bout Duration

Breed et al 2009, Jonson et al 2003, 2005

Statistical Analyses

Paired Tracks

- Paired T-tests
- Wilcoxon tests

Grouped by Year

- Anova with post-hoc
 Tukey-Kramer
- Wilcoxon Signed Rank



Programs – Jmp and R

2010 El Niño and Yearly Variation

The 2010 El Niño did not exceed the range of normal yearly variation



Results



2010 El Niño – female' s travel time and condition were within normal variation



Coastal vs. Pelagic Foragers in 2010 El Niño

No significant differences in trip duration or morphometrics



Results

Coastal vs. Pelagic Foragers

2010 El Niño

Coastal foragers spent a significantly longer percent of time in foraging mode than pelagic animals.

0.05 0.04 0.03 – Control Year 0.02 0.01 0 -0.01 * -0.02 2010 -0.03 -0.04Ш -0.05 Σ ⊲ -0.06 -0.07 -0.08 -0.09 Pelagic Coastal

Percent of Time in Foraging Mode

Conclusions

Summary

• No 2010 El Niño effects found when comparing the population as a whole.

Suggests a threshold severity in El Niño may be needed before northern elephant seals are negatively impacted.

BUT . . . On closer examination

• Coastal foraging females spent a greater percentage of their time in foraging mode than pelagic foragers.





Implications

- Coastal foraging female elephant seals may be more vulnerable to climate variability.
- El Niño events predicted to increase in frequency and intensity.
- Consequences on differential survival and reproduction of coastal females \rightarrow evolutionary changes.
- Global warming effects may push the overall population past their tolerance threshold.



Future Directions



- Analyze fatty acids for evidence of a diet change during El Niño.
- Examine oceanographic variables associated with seal foraging for differences between El Niño years.

• Combine data sets from the previous study with the TOPP data set.

• Examine the dive data, especially drift dive rate, for additional differences in foraging due to the 2010 El Niño.



Field Work and Support

Jen Maresh, Kim Goetz, Luis Huckstadt, Gitte McDonald, Cory Champagne, Carey Kuhn, Jason Hassrick, Stella Villegas, Ken Yoda, Yann Tremblay, Sarah Peterson, Pat Morris, Dave Foley, Mike Tift, Stephen Tavoni, Erin Pickett, John Harley, Ashley Pearson, Molly McCormley, the Costa Lab

Funding

- National Science Foundation Graduate Research Fellowship
- Clairol









THE David Lucile Foundation





